

U.S. Department of Labor

Occupational Safety and Health Administration
1000 Liberty Avenue
Room 905
Pittsburgh, PA 15222
Phone: 412-395-4903 Fax: 412-395-6380



Citation and Notification of Penalty

To:

FirstEnergy Generation LLC
128 Ferry Hill Road
Shippingport, PA 15077

Inspection Number: 1259737

Inspection Date(s): 08/30/2017 - 02/23/2018

Issuance Date: 02/27/2018

Inspection Site:

Bruce Mansfield Plant
128 Ferry Hill Road
Shippingport, PA 15077

The violation(s) described in this Citation and Notification of Penalty is (are) alleged to have occurred on or about the day(s) the inspection was made unless otherwise indicated within the description given below.

This Citation and Notification of Penalty (this Citation) describes violations of the Occupational Safety and Health Act of 1970. The penalty(ies) listed herein is (are) based on these violations. You must abate the violations referred to in this Citation by the dates listed and pay the penalties proposed, unless within 15 working days (excluding weekends and Federal holidays) from your receipt of this Citation and Notification of Penalty **you either call to schedule an informal conference (see paragraph below) or** you mail a notice of contest to the U.S. Department of Labor Area Office at the address shown above. Please refer to the enclosed booklet (OSHA 3000) which outlines your rights and responsibilities and which should be read in conjunction with this form. Issuance of this Citation does not constitute a finding that a violation of the Act has occurred unless there is a failure to contest as provided for in the Act or, if contested, unless this Citation is affirmed by the Review Commission or a court.

Posting - The law requires that a copy of this Citation and Notification of Penalty be posted immediately in a prominent place at or near the location of the violation(s) cited herein, or, if it is not practicable because of the nature of the employer's operations, where it will be readily observable by all affected employees. This Citation must remain posted until the violation(s) cited herein has (have) been abated, or for 3 working days (excluding weekends and Federal holidays), whichever is longer.

Informal Conference - An informal conference is not required. However, if you wish to have such a conference you may request one with the Area Director during the 15 working day contest period. During such an informal conference you may present any evidence or views which you believe would support an adjustment to the citation(s) and/or penalty(ies).

If you are considering a request for an informal conference to discuss any issues related to this Citation and Notification of Penalty, you must take care to schedule it early enough to allow time to contest after the informal conference, should you decide to do so. Please keep in mind that a written letter of intent to contest must be submitted to the Area Director within 15 working days of your receipt of this Citation. The running of this contest period is not interrupted by an informal conference.

If you decide to request an informal conference, please complete, remove and post the Notice to Employees next to this Citation and Notification of Penalty as soon as the time, date, and place of the informal conference have been determined. Be sure to bring to the conference any and all supporting documentation of existing conditions as well as any abatement steps taken thus far. If conditions warrant, we can enter into an informal settlement agreement which amicably resolves this matter without litigation or contest.

Right to Contest – You have the right to contest this Citation and Notification of Penalty. You may contest all citation items or only individual items. You may also contest proposed penalties and/or abatement dates without contesting the underlying violations. **Unless you inform the Area Director in writing that you intend to contest the citation(s) and/or proposed penalty(ies) within 15 working days after receipt, the citation(s) and the proposed penalty(ies) will become a final order of the Occupational Safety and Health Review Commission and may not be reviewed by any court or agency.**

Penalty Payment – Penalties are due within 15 working days of receipt of this notification unless contested. (See the enclosed booklet and the additional information provided related to the Debt Collection Act of 1982.) Make your check or money order payable to "DOL-OSHA". Please indicate the Inspection Number on the remittance. You can also make your payment electronically on www.pay.gov. On the left side of the pay.gov homepage, you will see an option to Search Public Forms. Type "OSHA" and click Go. From the results, click on **OSHA Penalty Payment Form**. The direct link is:

<https://www.pay.gov/paygov/forms/formInstance.html?agencyFormId=53090334>.

You will be required to enter your inspection number when making the payment. Payments can be made by credit card or Automated Clearing House (ACH) using your banking information. Payments of \$25,000 or more require a Transaction ID, and also must be paid using ACH. If you require a Transaction ID, please contact the OSHA Debt Collection Team at (202) 693-2170.

OSHA does not agree to any restrictions or conditions or endorsements put on any check, money order, or electronic payment for less than the full amount due, and will process the payments as if these restrictions or conditions do not exist.

Notification of Corrective Action – For each violation which you do not contest, you must provide ***abatement certification*** to the Area Director of the OSHA office issuing the citation and identified above. This abatement certification is to be provided by letter within 10 calendar days after each abatement date. Abatement certification includes the date and method of abatement. If the citation indicates that the violation was corrected during the inspection, no abatement certification is required for that item. The abatement certification letter must be posted at the location where the violation appeared and the corrective action took place or employees must otherwise be effectively informed about abatement activities. A sample abatement certification letter is enclosed with this Citation. In addition, where the citation indicates that ***abatement documentation*** is necessary, evidence of the purchase or repair of equipment, photographs or video, receipts, training records, etc., verifying that abatement has occurred is required to be provided to the Area Director.

Employer Discrimination Unlawful – The law prohibits discrimination by an employer against an employee for filing a complaint or for exercising any rights under this Act. An employee who believes that he/she has been discriminated against may file a complaint no later than 30 days after the discrimination occurred with the U.S. Department of Labor Area Office at the address shown above.

Employer Rights and Responsibilities – The enclosed booklet (OSHA 3000) outlines additional employer rights and responsibilities and should be read in conjunction with this notification.

Notice to Employees – The law gives an employee or his/her representative the opportunity to object to any abatement date set for a violation if he/she believes the date to be unreasonable. The contest must be mailed to the U.S. Department of Labor Area Office at the address shown above and postmarked within 15 working days (excluding weekends and Federal holidays) of the receipt by the employer of this Citation and Notification of Penalty.

Inspection Activity Data – You should be aware that OSHA publishes information on its inspection and citation activity on the Internet under the provisions of the Electronic Freedom of Information Act. The information related to these alleged violations will be posted when our system indicates that you have received this citation. You are encouraged to review the information concerning your establishment at www.osha.gov. If you have any dispute with the accuracy of the information displayed, please contact this office.



NOTICE TO EMPLOYEES OF INFORMAL CONFERENCE

An informal conference has been scheduled with OSHA to discuss the citation(s) issued on 02/27/2018. The conference will be held by telephone or at the OSHA office located at 1000 Liberty Avenue, Room 905, Pittsburgh, PA 15222 on _____ at _____.

_____. Employees and/or representatives of employees have a right to attend an informal conference.

CERTIFICATION OF CORRECTIVE ACTION WORKSHEET

Inspection Number: 1259737

Company Name: FirstEnergy Generation LLC

Inspection Site: Bruce Mansfield Plant, 128 Ferry Hill Road, Shippingport, PA 15077

Issuance Date: 02/27/2018

List the specific method of correction for each item on this citation in this package that does not read "Corrected During Inspection" and return to: **U.S. Department of Labor – Occupational Safety and Health Administration, 1000 Liberty Avenue, Room 905, Pittsburgh, PA 15222**

Citation Number _____ and Item Number _____ was corrected on _____
By (Method of Abatement): _____

Citation Number _____ and Item Number _____ was corrected on _____
By (Method of Abatement): _____

Citation Number _____ and Item Number _____ was corrected on _____
By (Method of Abatement): _____

Citation Number _____ and Item Number _____ was corrected on _____
By (Method of Abatement): _____

Citation Number _____ and Item Number _____ was corrected on _____
By (Method of Abatement): _____

Citation Number _____ and Item Number _____ was corrected on _____
By (Method of Abatement): _____

I certify that the information contained in this document is accurate and that the affected employees and their representatives have been informed of the abatement.

Signature

Date

Typed or Printed Name

Title

NOTE: 29 USC 666(g) whoever knowingly makes any false statements, representation or certification in any application, record, plan or other documents filed or required to be maintained pursuant to the Act shall, upon conviction, be punished by a fine of not more than \$10,000 or by imprisonment of not more than 6 months or both.

POSTING: A copy of completed Corrective Action Worksheet should be posted for employee review

U.S. Department of Labor
Occupational Safety and Health Administration

Inspection Number: 1259737
Inspection Date(s): 08/30/2017 - 02/23/2018
Issuance Date: 02/27/2018



Citation and Notification of Penalty

Company Name: FirstEnergy Generation LLC

Inspection Site: Bruce Mansfield Plant, 128 Ferry Hill Road, Shippingport, PA 15077

Citation 1 Item 1 Type of Violation: **Serious**

29 CFR 1910.146(c)(6): When there were changes in the use or configuration of a non-permit confined space that could increase the hazards to entrants, the employer did not reevaluate that space and, when necessary, reclassify it as a permit-required confined space:

a) In the North Division Vault of the North LDS Pond, on or about August 29, 2017 - The employer failed to reevaluate and reclassify the vault as a permit-required confined space before mechanical contractors began to open the 24-inch LDS pipe line which introduced a water engulfment hazard, hydrogen sulfide atmospheric hazard and hazards associated with oxygen fuel gas torch use into the space.

Date By Which Violation Must be Abated:
Proposed Penalty:

Corrected During Inspection
\$12934.00

See pages 1 through 4 of this Citation and Notification of Penalty for information on employer and employee rights and responsibilities.



Citation and Notification of Penalty

Company Name: FirstEnergy Generation LLC

Inspection Site: Bruce Mansfield Plant, 128 Ferry Hill Road, Shippingport, PA 15077

The alleged violations below have been grouped because they involve similar or related hazards that may increase the potential for injury or illness.

Citation 1 Item 2 a Type of Violation: **Serious**

29 CFR 1910.146(c)(8)(i): When an employer arranged to have employees of another employer (contractor) perform work that involved permit space entry, the host employer did not inform the contractor that the workplace contained permit spaces and that permit space entry is allowed only through compliance with a permit space program meeting the requirements of this section:

a) In the North Division Vault of the North LDS Pond, on or about August 29, 2017 - The employer failed to inform the mechanical contractor that the vault was a permit-required confined space prior to entry by mechanical contractor employees.

Date By Which Violation Must be Abated:
Proposed Penalty:

Corrected During Inspection
\$12934.00

U.S. Department of Labor
Occupational Safety and Health Administration

Inspection Number: 1259737
Inspection Date(s): 08/30/2017 - 02/23/2018
Issuance Date: 02/27/2018



Citation and Notification of Penalty

Company Name: FirstEnergy Generation LLC

Inspection Site: Bruce Mansfield Plant, 128 Ferry Hill Road, Shippingport, PA 15077

Citation 1 Item 2 b Type of Violation: **Serious**

29 CFR 1910.146(c)(8)(ii): When an employer arranged to have employees of another employer (contractor) perform work that involved permit space entry, the host employer did not apprise the contractor of the elements, including the hazards identified and the host employer's experience with the space, that make the space in question a permit space:

a) In the North Division Vault of the North LDS Pond, on or about August 29, 2017 - The employer failed to apprise the mechanical contractor of the engulfment hazard, hazardous atmosphere hazards, and hazards associated with use of oxygen fuel gas torch cutting hazard during entry into the vault.

Date By Which Violation Must be Abated:

Corrected During Inspection

See pages 1 through 4 of this Citation and Notification of Penalty for information on employer and employee rights and responsibilities.

U.S. Department of Labor
Occupational Safety and Health Administration

Inspection Number: 1259737
Inspection Date(s): 08/30/2017 - 02/23/2018
Issuance Date: 02/27/2018



Citation and Notification of Penalty

Company Name: FirstEnergy Generation LLC

Inspection Site: Bruce Mansfield Plant, 128 Ferry Hill Road, Shippingport, PA 15077

Citation 1 Item 3 Type of Violation: **Serious**

29 CFR 1910.146(d)(5)(ii): Under the permit-required confined space program required by 29 CFR 1910.146(c)(4), the employer did not evaluate permit space conditions when entry operations were conducted by testing or monitoring the permit space as necessary to determine if acceptable entry conditions are being maintained during the course of entry operations:

a) In the North Division Vault of the North LDS Pond, on or about August 29, 2017 - The employer failed to monitor the vault for acceptable entry conditions while mechanical contractor employees were inside the vault conducting operations which could introduce hydrogen sulfide gas including removing a 24-inch LDS pipe elbow.

Date By Which Violation Must be Abated:
Proposed Penalty:

Corrected During Inspection
\$12934.00

U.S. Department of Labor
Occupational Safety and Health Administration

Inspection Number: 1259737
Inspection Date(s): 08/30/2017 - 02/23/2018
Issuance Date: 02/27/2018



Citation and Notification of Penalty

Company Name: FirstEnergy Generation LLC

Inspection Site: Bruce Mansfield Plant, 128 Ferry Hill Road, Shippingport, PA 15077

The alleged violations below have been grouped because they involve similar or related hazards that may increase the potential for injury or illness.

Citation 1 Item 4 a Type of Violation: **Serious**

29 CFR 1910.146(g)(1): The employer did not provide training so that all employees whose work was regulated by 29 CFR 1910.146 (permit required confined spaces) acquired the understanding, knowledge, and skills necessary for the safe performance of the duties assigned under 29 CFR 1910.146:

a) In the North Division Vault of the North LDS Pond, on or about August 29, 2017 - The entry supervisor/lead did not acquire understanding, knowledge, and skills necessary to perform duties assigned under 29 CFR 1910.146.

Date By Which Violation Must be Abated:
Proposed Penalty:

Corrected During Inspection
\$12934.00

U.S. Department of Labor
Occupational Safety and Health Administration

Inspection Number: 1259737
Inspection Date(s): 08/30/2017 - 02/23/2018
Issuance Date: 02/27/2018



Citation and Notification of Penalty

Company Name: FirstEnergy Generation LLC

Inspection Site: Bruce Mansfield Plant, 128 Ferry Hill Road, Shippingport, PA 15077

Citation 1 Item 4 b Type of Violation: **Serious**

29 CFR 1910.146(g)(3): The employer did not provide training that established employee proficiency in the duties required by 29 CFR 1910.146, Permit-required confined spaces, and did not introduce new or revised procedures, as necessary, for compliance with this section:

a) In the North Division Vault of the North LDS Pond, on or about August 29, 2017 - The employer failed to provide training that established the entry supervisor/lead's proficiency in the duties required by 29 CFR 1910.146.

Date By Which Violation Must be Abated:

Corrected During Inspection

U.S. Department of Labor
Occupational Safety and Health Administration

Inspection Number: 1259737
Inspection Date(s): 08/30/2017 - 02/23/2018
Issuance Date: 02/27/2018



Citation and Notification of Penalty

Company Name: FirstEnergy Generation LLC

Inspection Site: Bruce Mansfield Plant, 128 Ferry Hill Road, Shippingport, PA 15077

Citation 1 Item 5 Type of Violation: **Serious**

29 CFR 1910.1200(h)(3): The employee training did not include the requirements of 29 CFR 1910.1200(h)(3)(i) through (h)(3)(iv):

a) In the North Division Vault of the North LDS Pond, on or about August 29, 2017 - The employer failed to provide training to the entry supervisor/lead on the methods and observations used to detect the presence or release of hydrogen sulfide in the vault, health hazards of hydrogen sulfide in the vault, and measures employees can take to protect themselves from hydrogen sulfide in the vault.

Date By Which Violation Must be Abated:
Proposed Penalty:

Corrected During Inspection
\$12934.00

U.S. Department of Labor
Occupational Safety and Health Administration

Inspection Number: 1259737
Inspection Date(s): 08/30/2017 - 02/23/2018
Issuance Date: 02/27/2018



Citation and Notification of Penalty

Company Name: FirstEnergy Generation LLC

Inspection Site: Bruce Mansfield Plant, 128 Ferry Hill Road, Shippingport, PA 15077

The alleged violations below have been grouped because they involve similar or related hazards that may increase the potential for injury or illness.

Citation 1 Item 6 a Type of Violation: **Serious**

29 CFR 1910.1000(b)(2): Employee(s) were exposed to an airborne concentration of hydrogen sulfide listed in Table Z-2 in excess of the ceiling concentration of 20 ppm:

a) In the North Division Vault of the North LDS Pond, on or about August 30, 2017 - A FirstEnergy Generation LLC employee was hospitalized as a result of exposure to hydrogen sulfide gas above the ceiling concentration of 20 ppm while the FirstEnergy employee was at the top of the vault as contractors removed an elbow from the 24-inch LDS pipe line.

Date By Which Violation Must be Abated:
Proposed Penalty:

Corrected During Inspection
\$12934.00

See pages 1 through 4 of this Citation and Notification of Penalty for information on employer and employee rights and responsibilities.

U.S. Department of Labor
Occupational Safety and Health Administration

Inspection Number: 1259737
Inspection Date(s): 08/30/2017 - 02/23/2018
Issuance Date: 02/27/2018



Citation and Notification of Penalty

Company Name: FirstEnergy Generation LLC

Inspection Site: Bruce Mansfield Plant, 128 Ferry Hill Road, Shippingport, PA 15077

Citation 1 Item 6 b Type of Violation: **Serious**

29 CFR 1910.1000(e): Feasible administrative or engineering controls were not determined and implemented to achieve compliance with the limits prescribed in 29 CFR 1910.1000(a) through (d):

a) In the North Division Vault of the North LDS Pond, on or about August 30, 2017 - The employer failed to determine and implement feasible administrative or engineering controls to achieve compliance with the permissible exposure and ceiling limits for hydrogen sulfide while a FirstEnergy employee was working at the top of the vault and, at the same time, contractors removed an elbow from the 24-inch LDS pipe line.

Date By Which Violation Must be Abated:

Corrected During Inspection

See pages 1 through 4 of this Citation and Notification of Penalty for information on employer and employee rights and responsibilities.

U.S. Department of Labor
Occupational Safety and Health Administration

Inspection Number: 1259737
Inspection Date(s): 08/30/2017 - 02/23/2018
Issuance Date: 02/27/2018



Citation and Notification of Penalty

Company Name: FirstEnergy Generation LLC

Inspection Site: Bruce Mansfield Plant, 128 Ferry Hill Road, Shippingport, PA 15077

Citation 1 Item 6 c Type of Violation: **Serious**

29 CFR 1910.134(c)(1): A written respiratory protection program that included the provisions in 29 CFR 1910.134(c)(1)(i) - (ix) with worksite specific procedures was not established and implemented for required respirator use:

a) In the North Division Vault of the North LDS Pond, on or about August 30, 2017 - The employer failed to implement the respiratory protection program for an employee who was exposed to hydrogen sulfide above the permissible exposure and ceiling limits while contractors were inside the vault removing an elbow from a 24-inch line that contained water, hydrogen sulfide gas, and ash slurry.

Date By Which Violation Must be Abated:

Corrected During Inspection

U.S. Department of Labor
Occupational Safety and Health Administration

Inspection Number: 1259737
Inspection Date(s): 08/30/2017 - 02/23/2018
Issuance Date: 02/27/2018



Citation and Notification of Penalty

Company Name: FirstEnergy Generation LLC

Inspection Site: Bruce Mansfield Plant, 128 Ferry Hill Road, Shippingport, PA 15077

Citation 1 Item 6 d Type of Violation: **Serious**

29 CFR 1910.134(d)(1)(i): An appropriate respirator was not selected and provided based on the respiratory hazard(s) to which the worker is exposed and workplace and user factors that affect respirator performance and reliability:

a) In the North Division Vault of the North LDS Pond, on or about August 30, 2017 - The employer failed to select and provide appropriate respiratory protection to an employee who was exposed to hydrogen sulfide gas above the permissible exposure limit.

Date By Which Violation Must be Abated:

Corrected During Inspection

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "C.M. Robinson", written over a horizontal line.

Christopher M. Robinson
Area Director

U.S. Department of Labor
Occupational Safety and Health Administration
1000 Liberty Avenue
Room 905
Pittsburgh, PA 15222
Phone: 412-395-4903 Fax: 412-395-6380



INVOICE / DEBT COLLECTION NOTICE

Company Name: FirstEnergy Generation LLC
Inspection Site: Bruce Mansfield Plant, 128 Ferry Hill Road, Shippingport, PA 15077
Issuance Date: 02/27/2018

Summary of Penalties for Inspection Number	1259737
Citation 1, Serious	\$77604.00
TOTAL PROPOSED PENALTIES	\$77604.00

To avoid additional charges, please remit payment promptly to this Area Office for the total amount of the uncontested penalties summarized above. Make your check or money order payable to: "DOL-OSHA". Please indicate OSHA's Inspection Number (indicated above) on the remittance. You can also make your payment electronically on www.pay.gov. On the left side of the pay.gov homepage, you will see an option to Search Public Forms. Type "OSHA" and click Go. From the results, click on **OSHA Penalty Payment Form**. The direct link is <https://www.pay.gov/paygov/forms/formInstance.html?agencyFormId=53090334>. You will be required to enter your inspection number when making the payment. Payments can be made by credit card or Automated Clearing House (ACH) using your banking information. Payments of \$25,000 or more require a Transaction ID, and also must be paid using ACH. If you require a Transaction ID, please contact the OSHA Debt Collection Team at (202) 693-2170.

OSHA does not agree to any restrictions or conditions or endorsements put on any check, money order, or electronic payment for less than the full amount due, and will cash the check or money order as if these restrictions or conditions do not exist.

If a personal check is issued, it will be converted into an electronic fund transfer (EFT). This means that our bank will copy your check and use the account information on it to electronically debit your account for the amount of the check. The debit from your account will then usually occur within 24 hours and will be shown on your regular account statement. You will not receive your original check back. The bank will destroy your original check, but will keep a copy of it. If the EFT cannot be completed because of insufficient funds or closed account, the bank will attempt to make the transfer up to 2 times.

Pursuant to the Debt Collection Act of 1982 (Public Law 97-365) and regulations of the U.S. Department of Labor (29 CFR Part 20), the Occupational Safety and Health Administration is required to assess interest, delinquent charges, and administrative costs for the collection of delinquent penalty debts for violations of the Occupational Safety and Health Act.

Interest: Interest charges will be assessed at an annual rate determined by the Secretary of the Treasury on all penalty debt amounts not paid within one month (30 calendar days) of the date on which the debt amount becomes due and payable (penalty due date). The current interest rate is one percent (1%). Interest will accrue from the date on which the penalty amounts (as proposed or adjusted) become a final order of the Occupational Safety and Health Review Commission (that is, 15 working days from your receipt of the Citation and Notification of Penalty), unless you file a notice of contest. Interest charges will be waived if the full amount owed is paid within 30 calendar days of the final order.

Delinquent Charges: A debt is considered delinquent if it has not been paid within one month (30 calendar days) of the penalty due date or if a satisfactory payment arrangement has not been made. If the debt remains delinquent for more than 90 calendar days, a delinquent charge of six percent (6%) per annum will be assessed accruing from the date that the debt became delinquent.

Administrative Costs: Agencies of the Department of Labor are required to assess additional charges for the recovery of delinquent debts. These additional charges are administrative costs incurred by the Agency in its attempt to collect an unpaid debt. Administrative costs will be assessed for demand letters sent in an attempt to collect the unpaid debt.



Christopher M. Robinson

Area Director

2-27-2018

Date